

*City of Biddeford*  
**Historic Preservation Commission**  
**October 11, 2023 4:00 PM City Hall Council Chambers & Zoom**

**Status: Historic Preservation Meeting, Wednesday, October 11, 2023, 4:00, Council Chambers & Zoom**

**Attending: Leah Schaffer, Allie Tobey, Erin Ware, Jeff Cabral**

**Leah brought the meeting to order at 4:00 PM**

**1. Adjustments to the Agenda -None**

**2. Consideration of Meeting Minutes**

2.1. Approval of Meeting Minutes from September 13, 2023

MOTION: 4:04 PM

Ware-Motion to approve Meeting Minutes from 9-13-23 as submitted, Tobey-second-motion passed unanimously

**3. New Business**

3.1. 2023.27 HPC Public Hearing to discuss and take questions regarding a project by Jean LeClerc to make exterior alterations at 139 Alfred Street (Tax Map 38, Lot 449) in the MSRD-1 zone.

- Mr. LeClerc represented himself
- Replacing windows and roof
- Will use Pella double hung windows (vinyl)
- Ms. Ware-asked about the condition of the casement of the windows. The applicant answered that the house was vacant for 3-5 years, casements are in poor condition, the windows are not salvageable as they are rotting. The applicant did not consider replacing with clad wood windows. He does not want to keep replacing the windows. The Commission members said clad wood windows last and are preferable.
- Ms. Schaffer, said what exists is not the original windows but wood. We would like to keep with same material or go with aluminum clad instead of vinyl. Light pattern? Original 2 over 1, he is going with double pane 1 over 1. Ms. Schaffer mentioned we like to keep the same historic profile. Mr. Leclerc does not feel rebuilt windows would affect the façade of house. Siding will remain the same.
- CertainTeed will do the roof in the architectural series.
- The Commission determined that the form of house is historic but windows do need replacing. Aluminum windows would be preferred. All windows are staying casement, upstairs will be crank out in order to be egress.
- Public-Alexa Plotkin & Amy Clearwater-across street abutters-are very much in favor of this project. They would like to warn the applicant that he should be careful that there is no lead in the new windows.
- Mr. Favreau reminded the Board about preserving the integrity of the historic value of the house, be aware of “death by a thousand cuts.” This will eventually influence the neighborhood.

- Difference of life expectancy between vinyl and aluminum is 10 years; it depends also on the conditions of where the windows are. House is north facing so it gets no sun.

MOTION: 4:33 PM

Cabral-Motion-approve to COA for 139 Alfred with materials submitted with the condition that the windows be 2/1 would be vinyl, any casement window have the larger middle emollient to appear to be the double hung window.

Ware-Second-Motion passed unanimously

- 3.2. 2023.30 HPC Public Hearing to discuss and take questions regarding an application by Alex Fabish to make exterior porch alterations at 48 Bacon Street (Tax Map 39, Lot 131) in the MSRD-2 zone.

- Alex Fabish represented himself, wants to build a new porch on Bacon Street.
- Ms. Ware is noting the extreme changes he is making to the historic integrity of the house.
- Ms. Ware would like the porch restored. Mr. Fabish is afraid of a porch collapse the material is not safe.
- Ms. Schaffer talked about rebuilding as is.
- Mr. Fabish will do what is asked but needs to know what we want. He would prefer not to come back.
- Ms. Ware suggests postponing the vote until we see new plans and can approve the re-creation.

Motion: 4:49 PM

Ware- To postpone project to give applicant time to redesign the plans with specifications to recreate original work

Cabral-second Motion passed unanimously

Jeff Cabral left meeting for another commitment.

- 3.3. 2023.28 HPC Public Hearing to discuss and take questions regarding an application by YD Properties LLC to present exterior alterations at 227 Elm Street (Tax Map 38, Lot 205) in the MSRD-2 zone, some of which have been made after the fact.

- Steve Cheung represented the applicant
- Structure was purchased and clean up started construction started with no permit.
- Did not know it was in the historic preservation area.
- Front door has been replaced as soon as he was aware that the house was in a historic district the applicant came in to correct the issue.
- Building will be gutted, all mechanicals will be replaced and a sprinkler system has been added.
- Applicant is looking for best course of action.
- Structure went from a 6 family to a 9 family.
- Windows on South Street were rearranged; some windows had to be moved to accommodate utilities.
- Caleb Johnson did architectural plans and elevations, which should be submitted. Applicant will email them to Mr. Favreau.
- On one hand, it seems what has been done is done but the HPC has the right to deny the COA.

- Certificate of Occupancy may be denied if the Certificate of Appropriateness is denied.
- Biggest issues: Openings and rhythm of building has been broken, changes in the windows have damaged the historic integrity of the house, windows are different sizes, bathroom windows are next to hallway windows and bathroom windows are smaller impeding the symmetry of the house. Matching windows and windows set at the same header height is important; applicant will look into making adjustment. Salvage as much of the porch as possible or recreate it. Reframe the posts of the porch. Front door is off centered; originally, door was probably centered not sure when or why door was moved. Can they put a 36" door in the middle of the porch as was originally created?
- Ms. Ware would like to see solid panel on bottom of front door.
- Ms. Schaffer wants documentation on what style of door will be used, send in cut sheet and material.
- Chimneys should have been repaired instead of removed. Oil boiler that was original has been removed; natural gas has been brought in with direct vent. The multiple chimneys gives the distinctive character to the building but they will not make the applicant replace them.
- Dormer windows will be symmetrical going up to roof. Dormer windows will be full size (height) as previously designed.
- All windows should be the same. Window sizes should be corrected in restoration.
- Siding will remain blue vinyl.
- Eave return trim will be same as the top with the vinyl soffit. Fascia board was already covered with vinyl so that was replaced with PVC aluminum.
- Change of siding is erroneous for the age of this house. Cedar shakes on a portion is not of this time period, the vinyl should have gone all the way up. (This is not from the Queen Ann period). Band board and cedar impressions should be removed having blue clapboard go all the way up.
- 6 soffit lights on each gable end in order to light up the corner. They are trying to dissuade this area from becoming a hangout for nefarious purposes. Some of the Board has no problem with them. It is suggested to add lighting lower to the ground for safety purposes at the stairs and entries.
- The back of the building is visible from the street because house is on a corner.
- Windows were shifted to gain space on the interior of the structure.
- Would like to see original proposed elevations.
- In order to accommodate size of electrical service, windows had to be shifted 12'
- Sprinkler system is in; everything else is roughed in, no insulation or sheet rock. Windows should be aligned more evenly; applicant feels he can do that.
- Ms. Schaffer would like to see where windows end up and how they can be aligned.
- First and second floor stack but the third floor does not, bottom right egress window may not be able to be used.

- Stack windows on first and second floor as they can, some windows need to be redrawn and relooked at compared to the number of moves that need to be made. The bottom line is the applicant needs to show more alignment and symmetry. A suggestion is to add another window to first and second floor on the left side.
- Applicant proposes to line up all windows from third floor down except bottom right. However once the board looks at the plans they may have a better solutions. Applicant can work on interior at his own risk; changes made to windows may affect rough in work.
- Basement windows should all match. Applicant is considering having the basement openings sealed up, as it is all mechanicals down there.
- Railing for front porch should be wood in order to remain historically accurate.

MOTION: 6:11 pm

Ware-Motion to approve conditions: 2 windows above door equal size the symmetrical, 6 windows on 2<sup>nd</sup> floor same height, salvage porch roof, rebuild deck, 2 side windows full height in front, remove cedar impressions replace with blue siding all the way up, align windows on north elevation as discussed and sketched at meeting, all basement windows should match. Vote for front door and railing will be postponed until materials have been submitted.

Tobey-Second-Motion passed unanimously

#### 4. Other Business

- Pricing and value of windows and how to choose were discussed, Sierra Pacific have more options for historic structures at a better price point. Many of the other window companies have fewer options, however if research is done there are options out there. Applicants should be encouraged to get more than 1 window quote.
- Ongoing problems should be addressed, hand out pamphlets, welcome letters to new owners in MSRD and have historic district added to assessor's page.
- We cannot design people's project but we can tell them what they should use and what they cannot use.

#### 5. Adjourn Meeting was adjourned at 6:31 PM

---

Committee Chair/Vice Chair

---

Date